IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE NASHVILLE DIVISION

JODI MCCLAY,)	
Plaintiff,)	
v.)	NO. 3:17-cv-0705 JUDGE RICHARDSON
AIRPORT MANAGEMENT SERVICES, LLC,)	JOBOL RICHINDSON
Defendant.)	

ORDER CERTIFYING QUESTIONS OF STATE LAW TO THE SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE

This case is a personal-injury action filed on April 11, 2017, pursuant to this Court's diversity jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. § 1332, by Plaintiff Jodi McClay against Defendant Airport Management Services, LLC. Plaintiff sought damages for injuries she sustained in the Hudson News store at Nashville International Airport in August 2016. The case was tried to a jury on January 8-11, 2019. The jury returned a verdict for Plaintiff in the amount of \$444,500 for future medical expenses and \$930,000 for non-economic damages (Doc. No. 61), and judgment was entered in accordance with the verdict (Doc. No. 62).

Defendant made an oral motion following the verdict and, as directed by the Court, thereafter filed a written motion to apply the Tennessee statutory cap on noneconomic damages, found at Tenn. Code Ann. § 29-39-102, to the jury award (Doc. No. 63). Plaintiff responded, challenging the constitutionality of the statutory cap (Doc. No. 64), Defendant filed a Reply (Doc. No. 77), and Plaintiff filed a Sur-Reply (Doc. No. 80). Because the jury awarded non-economic

damages \$180,000 in excess of the \$750,000 statutory cap—meaning that application of the cap would reduce the judgment by \$180,000— the constitutionality of the cap is ripe for determination.

The issue of whether Tenn. Code Ann. § 29-39-102 violates the Tennessee Constitution was presented to the Tennessee Supreme Court in *Clark v. Cain*, 479 S.W. 3d 830 (Tenn. 2015). There, the Court found that the issue was not ripe because the case was at the summary judgment stage. Here, however, ripeness is beyond dispute because judgment has been entered, and the jury award for non-economic damages exceeds the statutory cap.

On May 3, 2018, the United States Court of Appeals for the Sixth Circuit (properly seeking to anticipate how the Tennessee Supreme Court would decide the issue) held that Tennessee's statutory cap on punitive damages, found at Tenn. Code Ann. § 29-39-104, "violates the individual right to a trial by jury set forth in the Tennessee Constitution." *Lindenberg v. Jackson Nat'l Life Ins. Co.*, 912 F. 3d 348, 364 (6th Cir. 2018). Like the Tennessee Supreme Court, however, the Sixth Circuit has not issued an opinion as to the constitutionality of the statutory cap on non-economic damages.

QUESTIONS OF LAW

Pursuant to Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 23, the following questions of state law have been raised by Plaintiff in this case and are hereby certified to the Supreme Court of Tennessee:

- (1) Does the non-economic damages cap in civil cases imposed by Tenn, Code Ann. § 29-39-102 violate a plaintiff's right to a trial by jury, as guaranteed in Article I, section 6, of the Tennessee Constitution?
- (2) Does the non-economic damages cap in civil cases imposed by Tenn. Code Ann. § 29-39-102 violate Tennessee's constitutional doctrine of separation of powers between the legislature branch and the judicial branch?

(3) Does the non-economic damages cap in civil cases imposed by Tenn. Code Ann. § 29-

39-102 violate the Tennessee Constitution by discriminating disproportionately against women?

Pursuant to Tenn. Sup. Ct. R. 23, Sec. 4, the Clerk of Court is hereby directed to serve

copies of this Certification Order upon all counsel of record in this case and file with the Clerk of

the Tennessee Supreme Court in Nashville this Certification Order under the seal of this Court,

along with proof of service.

The Court hereby designates Plaintiff Jodi McClay as the moving party for purposes of

certification. The parties and their counsel of record are:

Jodi McClay

Edmund J. Schmidt, III

Law Office of Eddie Schmidt

2323 21st Avenue South

Suite 502

Nashville, TN 37212

Airport Management Services, LLC

Lauren L. Holloway

Law Offices of Lauren L. Holloway

1299 Zurich Way

Suite 300

Schaumburg, IL 60196

IT IS SO ORDERED.

ELIRICHARDSON

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

3